

NICHOLAS W. BROWN  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Washington*  
Cristina Sepe, WSBA 53609, CA 308023  
Marsha Chien, WSBA 47020  
Kelly A. Paradis, WSBA 47175  
*Deputy Solicitors General*  
1125 Washington Street SE  
PO Box 40100  
Olympia, WA 98504-0100  
360-753-6200

[Additional Counsel Listed on Signature Page]

ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL  
*Attorney General*  
*Commonwealth of Massachusetts*  
Tasha J. Bahal, BBO 675935  
*Deputy State Solicitor*  
David R. Rangaviz, BBO 681430  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
*Civil Rights Division*  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108  
617-963-2816  
david.rangaviz@mass.gov

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

SAN JOSE DIVISION

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18

THE STANFORD DAILY PUBLISHING CORPORATION, JANE DOE, & JOHN DOE,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MARCO RUBIO, in his official capacity as Secretary of State, & KRISTI NOEM, in her official capacity as Secretary of Homeland Security,

Defendants.

Case No. 5:25-cv-06618-NW

**PROPOSED BRIEF OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS AND THE STATES OF WASHINGTON, CALIFORNIA, ARIZONA, COLORADO, CONNECTICUT, DELAWARE, HAWAI'I, ILLINOIS, MAINE, MARYLAND, MICHIGAN, MINNESOTA, NEW JERSEY, NEW MEXICO, NEW YORK, OREGON, RHODE ISLAND, VERMONT & THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA AS AMICI CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION AND INTERESTS OF AMICI .....I

II. BACKGROUND..... 3

    A. The Ideological Deportation Policy ..... 3

    B. Noncitizen Residents, Students, and Faculty Benefit Amici States..... 9

III. THE IDEOLOGICAL DEPORTATION POLICY INFLICTS SEVERE AND  
IRREPARABLE HARM ON AMICI STATES AND IS CONTRARY TO THE  
PUBLIC INTEREST ..... 133

    A. If Not Enjoined, The Ideological Deportation Policy Will Continue To Inflict  
Educational and Institutional Harm on Colleges and Universities Within Amici  
States..... 133

    B. If Not Enjoined, The Ideological Deportation Policy Will Continue To Harm  
Public Safety, Public Health, and Religious Worship in Amici States ..... 200

IV. CONCLUSION ..... 211

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

Cases

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

*AAUP v. Rubio*,  
No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.)..... passim

*Am.-Arab Anti-Discrimination Comm. v. Reno*,  
70, F.3d 1045, 1063-64 (9th Cir. 1995) ..... 1

*Cramp v. Bd. of Pub. Instruction of Orange Cnty.*,  
368 U.S. 278 (1961)..... 15

*Grayned v. City of Rockford*,  
408 U.S. 104 (1972)..... 17

*Keyishian v. Bd. of Regents of Univ. of State of N.Y.*,  
385 U.S. 589 (1967)..... 14

*Martin v. City of Struthers*,  
319 U.S. 141 (1943)..... 16

*Ng Fung Ho v. White*,  
259 U.S. 276 (1922)..... 17

*Ozturk v. Hyde*,  
No. 1:25-cv-10695-DJC, 2025 WL 1009445 (D. Mass. Apr. 4, 2025)..... 6, 8

*Ozturk v. Trump*,  
No. 1:25-cv-10695-DJC, 2025 WL (D. Mass. Apr. 4, 2025).....8

*Reno v. ACLU*,  
521 U.S. 844 (1997).....2

*Rosenberger v. Rector & Visitors of Univ. of Va.*,  
515 U.S. 819 (1995)..... 16

*Snyder v. Phelps*,  
562 U.S. 443 (2011)..... 14

*Sweezy v. State of N.H. ex rel. Wyman*,  
354 U.S. 234 (1957)..... 15

*Taal v. Trump*,  
No. 3:25-cv-00335, 2025 WL 926207 (N.D.N.Y. Mar. 27, 2025)..... 5

1 *Trump v. J.G.G.*,  
 2 604 U.S. \_\_\_, 2025 WL 1024097 (2025)..... 8

3 *United States v. Verdugo-Urquidez*,  
 4 494 U.S. 259 (1990)..... 1

5 *W. Va. State Bd. of Educ. v. Barnette*,  
 6 319 U.S. 624 (1943)..... 2

7 Statutes

8 8 U.S.C. § 1182 (a)(3)(C)(iii)..... 5

9 8 U.S.C. § 1201(i)..... 5

10 8 U.S.C. § 1227(a)(4)(C)(i)..... 5

11 Other Authorities

12 ACLU, *The Excluded: Ideological Exclusion and the War on Ideas* (2007),  
 13 <https://www.aclu.org/documents/excluded-ideological-exclusion-and-war-ideas>..... 5

14 Aidan Enright, et al., *International Students: Poorly Suited Immigration Pathways Stymie  
 15 Formation of High Growth Businesses 4*, Pioneer Institute, (July 2024),  
 16 <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED656349.pdf>..... 10

17 American Immigration Council, *Immigrants in California*,  
 18 <https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/california/>..... 10

19 American Immigration Council, *New Americans in Massachusetts* (2023),  
 20 <https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/massachusetts/>..... 10

21 Americans for the Arts, *Arts Impact Explorer Fact Sheet: Arts + Immigration* (July 2024),  
 22 [https://ww2.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/2025-  
 23 01/Arts%20%2B%20Immigration.pdf](https://ww2.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/2025-01/Arts%20%2B%20Immigration.pdf)..... 11

24 Ana Faguy, *US State Department revoked 6,000 student visas*, BBC (Aug. 18, 2025),  
 25 <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cz93vzndx07o> ..... 5

26 Andy J. Semotiuk, *Silencing Dissent: U.S. Moves To Deport Kremlin Critic Kseniia  
 27 Petrova*, Forbes (Mar. 30, 2025),  
 28 [https://www.forbes.com/sites/andyjsemotiuk/2025/03/30/silencing-dissent-us-moves-to-  
 deport-kremlin-critic-ksenii-petrova/](https://www.forbes.com/sites/andyjsemotiuk/2025/03/30/silencing-dissent-us-moves-to-deport-kremlin-critic-ksenii-petrova/) ..... 7

Anvee Bhutani, *US student journalists go dark fearing Trump crusade against pro-  
 Palestinian speech*, The Guardian (Apr. 7, 2025), [https://www.theguardian.com/us-  
 news/2025/apr/07/student-journalists-remove-stories-trump](https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2025/apr/07/student-journalists-remove-stories-trump) ..... 17

1 Aurelien Breeden, *U.S. Turned Away French Scientist Over Views on Trump Policies*, N.Y.  
 2 Times (Mar. 20, 2025), <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/03/20/world/europe/us-france-scientist-entry-trump-messages.html> ..... 7

3 Benjamin Bardman, *Trump Immigration Actions are Likely to Have a Chilling Effect on*  
 4 *Online Speech*, Vanderbilt J. of Ent. & Tech. L. (Mar. 31, 2025),  
 5 <https://www.vanderbilt.edu/jetlaw/2025/03/31/trump-immigration-actions/> ..... 17

6 Brian D. Smedly, et al., Institute of Medicine (US) Committee on Understanding and  
 7 Eliminating Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Health Care, *Unequal Treatment: Confronting Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Healthcare*, at 123 (2003),  
 8 [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK220358/pdf/Bookshelf\\_NBK220358.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK220358/pdf/Bookshelf_NBK220358.pdf) ..... 11

9 Chris Yiu, et al., *A research and policy agenda for the post-pandemic world*, Future  
 10 Healthcare J. (July 2021), <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC8285152/> ..... 15

11 Claire Rafford, *Fewer international students are in Indianapolis this fall*, Open Campus  
 12 (Sept. 26, 2025), <https://www.opencampus.org/2025/09/26/fewer-international-students-are-in-indianapolis-this-fall/> ..... 3

13 C-SPAN, *Secretary Rubio Defends Revoking Turkish Student’s Visa*, Mar. 27, 2025,  
 14 <https://www.c-span.org/clip/news-conference/secretary-rubio-defends-revoking-turkish-students-visa/5158479> ..... 7

15 Diana F. Yefanova, et al., *Instructional Practices Facilitating Cross-National Interactions*  
 16 *in Undergraduate Classes*, 7 J. of Int’l Students 786 (2017) ..... 12

17 Edward Wong, *Rubio Orders U.S. Diplomats to Scour Student Visa Applicants’ Social*  
 18 *Media*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 25, 2025),  
 19 <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/04/01/us/politics/student-visas-social-media.html> ..... 6

20 Eilis O’Neill, et al., *ICE detains leader of farmworker union in northwest Washington state*,  
 21 KUOW (Mar. 26, 2025), <https://www.kuow.org/stories/ice-detains-farmworker-activist-in-northwest-washington-state> ..... 7

22 Emma Johnson, *‘SCARED TO LEAVE MY HOUSE’ Mavericks react to ICE-detained*  
 23 *student, what’s being done*, The Reporter (Apr. 8, 2025),  
 24 <https://www.msureporter.com/2025/04/08/scared-to-leave-my-house/> ..... 17

25 Exec. Order 14,161, 90 Fed. Reg. 8451 (Jan. 20, 2025)..... 4

26 Exec. Order 14,188, 90 Fed. Reg. 8847 (Jan. 29, 2025)..... 4, 6

27 Jack Healy & Jazmine Ulloa, *‘We Finally Got You.’ Immigrant-Rights Advocate Arrested in*  
 28 *Colorado*, N.Y. Times (Mar. 18, 2025),  
<https://www.nytimes.com/2025/03/18/us/immigrant-arrest.html> ..... 7

1 Jeff Tollefson, *International PhD students make emergency plans in fear of US immigration*  
 2 *raids*, Nature (Apr. 4, 2025), <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-025-01056-5> ..... 17

3 John P. Moore & Ian A. Wilson, *Decades of basic research paved the way for today’s*  
 4 *‘warp speed’ Covid-19 vaccines*, Stat (Jan. 5, 2021),  
 5 [https://www.statnews.com/2021/01/05/basic-research-paved-way-for-warp-speed-covid-](https://www.statnews.com/2021/01/05/basic-research-paved-way-for-warp-speed-covid-19-vaccines/)  
 6 [19-vaccines/](https://www.statnews.com/2021/01/05/basic-research-paved-way-for-warp-speed-covid-19-vaccines/)..... 15

7 Josh Dawsey, et al., *Trump told donors he will crush pro-Palestinian protests, deport*  
 8 *demonstrators*, Washington Post (May 27, 2024),  
 9 <https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/2024/05/27/trump-israel-gaza-policy-donors/>..... 6

10 Judit Kende, et al., *Social and institutional inclusion in multi-ethnic schools enable better*  
 11 *intergroup relations for majority youth and higher school achievement for minority*  
 12 *youth*, 103 Int’l J. of Intercultural Rel. (Nov. 2024),  
 13 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0147176724001573> ..... 12

14 L.E. Gomez & Patrick Bernet, *Diversity improves performance and outcomes*,  
 15 111 J. Nat’l Med. Ass’n 383, 391 (Aug. 2019),  
 16 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0027968418303584?via%3Dihub> .... 11

17 Lexi Lonas Cochran, *Trump crackdown casts chill over international student programs*,  
 18 The Hill (Apr. 3, 2025), [https://thehill.com/homenews/education/5226292-trump-](https://thehill.com/homenews/education/5226292-trump-immigration-crackdown-international-students-college-campus-protests-ice-rubio-deportation-khalil/)  
 19 [immigration-crackdown-international-students-college-campus-protests-ice-rubio-](https://thehill.com/homenews/education/5226292-trump-immigration-crackdown-international-students-college-campus-protests-ice-rubio-deportation-khalil/)  
 20 [deportation-khalil/](https://thehill.com/homenews/education/5226292-trump-immigration-crackdown-international-students-college-campus-protests-ice-rubio-deportation-khalil/)..... 17

21 Liam Knox, *‘Palpable Fear’ Hangs Over International Students*, Inside Higher Ed  
 22 (Mar. 18, 2025), [https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/18/international-students-navigate-escalating-threats)  
 23 [us/2025/03/18/international-students-navigate-escalating-threats](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/18/international-students-navigate-escalating-threats) ..... 17

24 Liam Knox, *International Enrollment’s Precarious Moment*, Inside Higher Ed  
 25 (Mar. 19, 2025), [https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/19/colleges-fear-decline-international-student)  
 26 [us/2025/03/19/colleges-fear-decline-international-student](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/19/colleges-fear-decline-international-student)..... 19

27 Liam Knox, *Student Visa Dagnet Reaches Small Colleges*, Inside Higher Ed  
 28 (Apr. 8, 2025), [https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/04/08/trump-admin-broadens-scope-student-visa)  
 29 [us/2025/04/08/trump-admin-broadens-scope-student-visa](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/04/08/trump-admin-broadens-scope-student-visa) ..... 20

30 M. Gessen, *Unmarked Vans. Secret Lists. Public Denunciations. Our Police State Has*  
 31 *Arrived.*, N.Y. Times (Apr. 2, 2025),  
 32 <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/04/02/opinion/trump-ice-immigrants.html> ..... 8

33 Marisa Kabas, *State Dept. demands ‘enhanced’ social media vetting of student visa*  
 34 *applicants*, The Handbasket (Mar. 26, 2025), [https://www.thehandbasket.co/p/state-dept-](https://www.thehandbasket.co/p/state-dept-enhanced-social-media-vetting-student-visa-applicants)  
 35 [enhanced-social-media-vetting-student-visa-applicants](https://www.thehandbasket.co/p/state-dept-enhanced-social-media-vetting-student-visa-applicants) ..... 16

1 Meg Anderson, *Police say ICE Tactics are eroding public trust in local law enforcement*,  
 2 NPR (Mar. 30, 2025), <https://www.npr.org/2025/03/30/nx-s1-5304236/police-say-ice-tactics-are-eroding-public-trust-in-local-law-enforcement> ..... 21

3 Miri Yemini, *Bridging Borders: Toward Equity in International Research Collaborations*  
 4 NAFSA (Nov./Dec. 2024), <https://www.nafsa.org/professional-resources/research-and-trends/trends-insights/bridging-borders-novdec24> ..... 15

5 Mission of the California State University, <https://www.calstate.edu/csu-system/about-the-csu/Pages/mission.aspx> ..... 14

7 Morhaf Al Achkar, et al., *Integrating Immigrant Health Professionals into the U.S. Healthcare Workforce: Barriers and Solutions*, J. Immigr. Minor Health, (Apr. 2023),  
 8 <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC10119818/> ..... 11

9 New American Economy, *The Contributions of New Americans in Massachusetts*  
 10 (Aug. 2016), <https://www.newamericaneconomy.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/nae-ma-report.pdf> ..... 10

11 Nicole Lou, *Over 350K Health Workers Face Deportation Risk*, MedPageToday.com  
 12 (Apr. 3, 2025), <https://www.medpagetoday.com/publichealthpolicy/workforce/114947> ..... 21

13 Olivia Ebertz, *Deportations and detainments are having a chilling effect at Brown*, Rhode  
 14 Island PBS (Mar. 27, 2025), <https://thepublicradio.org/education/deportations-and-detainments-are-having-a-chilling-effect-at-brown/> ..... 17

15 Paul N’Dri Konan, et al., *Cultural Diversity in the Classroom and its Effects on Academic Performance: A Cross-National Perspective*, 41 Soc. Psych. 230-37 (2010) ..... 12

16 Robin Hattersley, *Visa Revocations Leave Hundreds of International College Students in Limbo*, Campus Safety Magazine (Apr. 8, 2025),  
 18 <https://www.campussafetymagazine.com/news/visa-revocations-leave-international-college-students-in-limbo/169053/> ..... 19

19 Rümeyşa Öztürk, et al., *Op-ed: Try again, President Kumar: Renewing calls for Tufts to adopt March 4 TCU Senate resolutions*, The Tufts Daily (Mar. 26, 2024),  
 21 [www.tuftsdaily.com/article/2024/03/4ftk27sm6jkj](http://www.tuftsdaily.com/article/2024/03/4ftk27sm6jkj) ..... 7

22 Sean Cotter, et al., *Lawyers spar over court jurisdiction in case of Rümeyşa Öztürk, detained Tufts student*, Boston Globe (Apr. 3, 2025)  
 23 <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2025/04/03/metro/ozturk-hearing-in-boston-federal-court/> ..... 3

24 See NAFSA: Association of International Educators, *NAFSA International Student Economic Value Tool* (2023-24), <https://www.nafsa.org/policy-and-advocacy/policy-resources/nafsa-international-student-economic-value-tool-v2> ..... 11

25  
 26  
 27  
 28



1 Sophia Tareen, *Using helicopters and chemical agents, immigration agents become increasingly*  
 2 *aggressive in Chicago*, AP News (Oct. 6, 2025), [https://apnews.com/article/chicago-](https://apnews.com/article/chicago-immigration-federal-arrests-helicopter-trump-ice-8dbf688f78f3b6d1b8fdb989557b28c4)  
 3 [immigration-federal-arrests-helicopter-trump-ice-8dbf688f78f3b6d1b8fdb989557b28c4](https://apnews.com/article/chicago-immigration-federal-arrests-helicopter-trump-ice-8dbf688f78f3b6d1b8fdb989557b28c4)..... 8

4 Steven A. Holmes, *Legislation Eases Limits on Aliens*, N.Y. Times (Feb. 2, 1990),  
 5 <https://www.nytimes.com/1990/02/02/us/legislation-eases-limits-on-aliens.html> ..... 5

6 The White House, *Fact Sheet: President Donald J. Trump Takes Forceful and*  
 7 *Unprecedented Steps to Combat Anti-Semitism*, (Jan. 30, 2025),  
 8 [https://www.whitehouse.gov/fact-sheets/2025/01/fact-sheet-president-donald-j-trump-](https://www.whitehouse.gov/fact-sheets/2025/01/fact-sheet-president-donald-j-trump-takes-forceful-and-unprecedented-steps-to-combat-anti-semitism/)  
 9 [takes-forceful-and-unprecedented-steps-to-combat-anti-semitism/](https://www.whitehouse.gov/fact-sheets/2025/01/fact-sheet-president-donald-j-trump-takes-forceful-and-unprecedented-steps-to-combat-anti-semitism/) ..... 4

10 Tufts University, *University Declaration for Rümeysa Öztürk* (Apr. 2, 2025),  
 11 [https://www.tufts.edu/president/speeches-and-messages/04022025-university-](https://www.tufts.edu/president/speeches-and-messages/04022025-university-declaration-for-rumeysa-ozturk)  
 12 [declaration-for-rumeysa-ozturk](https://www.tufts.edu/president/speeches-and-messages/04022025-university-declaration-for-rumeysa-ozturk) ..... 18

13 UMass Amherst, *Global Partnerships*, [https://www.umass.edu/global-affairs/global-](https://www.umass.edu/global-affairs/global-partnerships)  
 14 [partnerships](https://www.umass.edu/global-affairs/global-partnerships) ..... 12

15 University of Illinois System, *International Partnerships*,  
 16 [https://www.uillinois.edu/about/international\\_partnerships](https://www.uillinois.edu/about/international_partnerships) ..... 12

17 University of Washington, *A Global University*, <https://www.washington.edu/global/> ..... 12

18 Vanessa G. Sánchez & Daniel Chang, *Immigration crackdowns disrupt caregivers.*  
 19 *Families are paying the price.*, NBC News (Apr. 3, 2025),  
 20 [https://www.nbcnews.com/health/health-news/trump-immigration-crackdowns-threaten-](https://www.nbcnews.com/health/health-news/trump-immigration-crackdowns-threaten-health-caregiving-us-families-rcna199383)  
 21 [health-caregiving-us-families-rcna199383](https://www.nbcnews.com/health/health-news/trump-immigration-crackdowns-threaten-health-caregiving-us-families-rcna199383) ..... 21

22 Constitutional Provisions

23 U.S. Const. amend. I..... 1, 9, 13-18

24

25

26

27

28



1 **I. Introduction and Interests of Amici**

2 The Commonwealth of Massachusetts and the States of California, Washington, Arizona,  
3 Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Hawaii, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Michigan, Minnesota, New  
4 Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, and the District of Columbia  
5 (“Amici States”) submit this brief in support of Plaintiffs’ motion for summary judgment and in  
6 opposition to the Defendants’ policy of ideological deportations—that is, punishing those who  
7 express disfavored views regarding America or Israel. This policy, which strips noncitizen students  
8 (including student journalists) and faculty of their lawful immigration status, threatens our  
9 academic institutions, economic prosperity, and global leadership in education and scientific  
10 innovation.  
11

12 The Trump Administration has weaponized immigration enforcement by targeting residents  
13 of Amici States with lawful immigration status based on their protected expression and beliefs. On  
14 its face, this policy violates the First Amendment’s protection of free speech, which the Supreme  
15 Court has repeatedly affirmed extends to noncitizen residents within the United States. *See, e.g.,*  
16 *United States v. Verdugo-Urquidez*, 494 U.S. 259, 271 (1990) (noting that “resident [noncitizens]  
17 have First Amendment rights” (citation omitted)); *Am.-Arab Anti-Discrimination Comm. v. Reno*,  
18 70, F.3d 1045, 1063-64 (9th Cir. 1995) (applying First Amendment to deportation setting). Indeed,  
19 just two weeks ago a federal court confronted this very policy in *AAUP v. Rubio*, concluding that  
20 it was “intentionally viewpoint-discriminatory” and that the policy’s “manner and method” of  
21 execution were adopted at least “in part intentionally to chill the speech of other” lawfully present  
22 noncitizens on campus.<sup>1</sup> That is because the ideological deportation policy strikes at the heart of  
23 what the First Amendment prohibits. “If there is any fixed star in our constitutional constellation,  
24 it is that no official, high or petty, can prescribe what shall be orthodox in politics, nationalism,  
25  
26  
27

28 <sup>1</sup> *See AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 135, 138 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.).

1 religion, or other matters of opinion.” *W. Va. State Bd. of Educ. v. Barnette*, 319 U.S. 624, 642  
2 (1943). Yet the Administration is doing precisely that—prescribing orthodoxy and punishing  
3 noncitizens who dissent through the severe sanctions of arrest, detention, and deportation. The  
4 policy is antithetical to the principle of free expression that is supposed to define American higher  
5 education. It creates a pernicious dynamic whereby noncitizens may self-censor for fear of losing  
6 their immigration status, and campus community members are thereby deprived of hearing their  
7 voices. *See Reno v. ACLU*, 521 U.S. 844, 845 (1997) (“The vagueness of such a content-based  
8 regulation . . . raise[s] special First Amendment concerns because of its obvious chilling effect on  
9 free speech.”). That pernicious dynamic is not theoretical: at *The Stanford Daily*, for example,  
10 multiple international student journalists have declined assignments, removed their bylines, or  
11 resigned entirely out of fear that their reporting could be used as grounds for deportation. Amici  
12 States have a strong interest in ensuring basic constitutional protections for all our residents, citizen  
13 and noncitizen alike.

14  
15  
16 The Defendants’ censorship of lawfully present noncitizens inflicts concrete, measurable  
17 harm on Amici States. As detailed *infra*, noncitizen students and faculty make substantial economic  
18 contributions to the Amici States. But their importance transcends economics; they enrich our  
19 academic discourse, strengthen our research capabilities, and enhance our global competitiveness.  
20 When students and faculty fear deportation for expressing certain viewpoints, the entire academic  
21 experience suffers. Classroom discussions become less robust, research questions go unexplored,  
22 and the pursuit of truth—the very purpose of higher education—is compromised. And the  
23 Defendants’ actions send a chilling message to talented students and faculty around the world: that  
24 they risk detention, deportation, and an end to their academic career in the United States if they  
25 express a viewpoint that displeases the Executive Branch. This message is already weakening  
26 Amici States’ position in the global competition for talent. Recent analyses project a steep drop in  
27  
28

1 international student enrollment in the United States—up to 150,000 fewer international students  
2 this fall alone—because of these (and other) punitive immigration policies.<sup>2</sup>

3 Amici States thrive by attracting a diversity of talent from around the world. The Trump  
4 Administration’s systematic program of targeted ideological revocations and deportations threatens  
5 not just our economies but our identities as Amici States, who value freedom of thought and  
6 expression. In the words of formerly detained Tufts student Rümeysa Öztürk, “the world is a more  
7 beautiful and peaceful place when we listen to each other and allow different perspectives to be in  
8 the room.”<sup>3</sup> Amici States have a profound interest in protecting our noncitizen students and faculty,  
9 the institutions they enrich, and the communities that realize far-reaching benefits from their  
10 decision to study in the United States. We urge this Court to recognize these benefits—and the  
11 corresponding concrete harms this policy inflicts—by entering judgment in favor of Plaintiffs to  
12 end the policy and practice of targeting our noncitizen residents for investigation, surveillance,  
13 arrest, detention, and deportation based upon their protected beliefs and expression.

## 16 **II. Background**

### 17 **A. *The Ideological Deportation Policy***

18 The Trump Administration, through two executive orders, laid the groundwork for  
19 deporting noncitizens with whom it politically disagrees. *See* Complaint ¶¶ 36-38 (citing executive  
20 orders as evidence of the Trump Administration’s targeting of noncitizens based on speech). *First*,  
21 Executive Order 14161 entitled “Protecting the United States from Foreign Terrorists and Other  
22 National Security and Public Safety Threats,” directs federal agencies to “vet and screen to the  
23

24  
25  
26 <sup>2</sup> Claire Rafford, *Fewer international students are in Indianapolis this fall*, Open Campus  
(Sept. 26, 2025), <https://www.opencampus.org/2025/09/26/fewer-international-students-are-in-indianapolis-this-fall/>.

27 <sup>3</sup> Sean Cotter, et al., *Lawyers spar over court jurisdiction in case of Rümeysa Öztürk*,  
28 *detained Tufts student*, Boston Globe (Apr. 3, 2025), <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2025/04/03/metro/ozturk-hearing-in-boston-federal-court/>.

1 maximum degree possible” foreign nationals seeking admission to (or already present in) the  
2 United States based not only on security concerns but also vague ideological grounds. Exec. Order  
3 14,161, § 2, 90 Fed. Reg. 8451 (Jan. 20, 2025). The Executive Order targets those who “espouse  
4 hateful ideology” and who “bear hostile attitudes toward [America’s] citizens, culture, government,  
5 institutions, or founding principles.” *Id.* § 1. *Second*, Executive Order 14188 entitled “Additional  
6 Measures to Combat Anti-Semitism,” intensifies this ideological vetting by urging particular  
7 scrutiny and potential removal of noncitizens affiliated with universities who engage in speech the  
8 Trump Administration deems anti-Semitic. This includes protected political expression, such as  
9 criticisms of the government and its position on the war in Gaza. Exec. Order 14,188, 90 Fed. Reg.  
10 8847 (Jan. 29, 2025). A White House fact sheet accompanying the second order makes its  
11 ideological purpose clear: it targets “leftist, anti-American colleges and universities,” applies to all  
12 “resident aliens who joined in the pro-jihadist protests,” and represents a “promise” that the  
13 government “will find you . . . and deport you.”<sup>4</sup> In effect, the first order authorizes an expansive  
14 regime of ideological deportations that the second order then aims at noncitizens attending colleges  
15 and universities who express pro-Palestinian viewpoints.

18 Combined, these orders empower the federal government to monitor, investigate, and  
19 deport noncitizens, not for actions that pose direct threats to national security of public safety but  
20 for expressions of political opinion. The Executive Orders thus direct the use of immigration laws  
21 to police dissent and chill First Amendment-protected speech.

26 \_\_\_\_\_  
27 <sup>4</sup> The White House, *Fact Sheet: President Donald J. Trump Takes Forceful and*  
28 *Unprecedented Steps to Combat Anti-Semitism*, (Jan. 30, 2025),  
<https://www.whitehouse.gov/fact-sheets/2025/01/fact-sheet-president-donald-j-trump-takes-forceful-and-unprecedented-steps-to-combat-anti-semitism/>.

1 To implement these Executive Orders, the Department of Homeland Security (DHS)  
 2 “proactively review[ed] open-source information to identify individuals[.]”<sup>5</sup> Such “open-source  
 3 information,” the government says, consists of “unclassified information that has been published  
 4 or broadcast in some manner to the general public.”<sup>6</sup> DHS then communicated that open-source  
 5 information to the Department of State, which makes a decision about visa or other status  
 6 revocation in “reli[ance] upon the underlying information and assessment provided by DHS/ICE.”<sup>7</sup>  
 7 In some cases, revocations that follow have been alleged to be rooted in the Secretary of State’s  
 8 statutory authority under 8 U.S.C. § 1227(a)(4)(C)(i), which authorizes deportation when the  
 9 Secretary “has reasonable ground to believe [the individual’s presence in the United States] would  
 10 have potentially serious adverse foreign policy consequences for the United States.”<sup>8</sup> More often,  
 11 the government has relied on the Secretary of State’s discretionary revocation authority. *See*  
 12 8 U.S.C. § 1201(i). To date, this “open-source” process has resulted in the revocation of more than  
 13 6,000 visas of noncitizen students—many of whom studied and lived in Amici States.<sup>9</sup>

16 \_\_\_\_\_  
 17 <sup>5</sup> Decl. of Unit Chief Roy M. Stanley, Doc. 30-2 at ¶ 5, *Taal v. Trump*, No. 3:25-cv-  
 00335, 2025 WL 926207 (N.D.N.Y. Mar. 27, 2025).

18 <sup>6</sup> *Id.*

19 <sup>7</sup> Decl. of John Armstrong, Doc. 30-3 at ¶ 5, *Taal*, 2025 WL 926207.

20 <sup>8</sup> Ironically, that statutory authority was meant to *eliminate* the McCarthy-era practice of  
 ideological exclusion. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1182 (a)(3)(C)(iii) (prohibiting exclusion “because of the  
 21 alien’s past, current, or expected beliefs, statements, or associations . . . unless the Secretary of  
 State personally determines that the alien’s admission would compromise a compelling United  
 States foreign policy interest”); Steven A. Holmes, *Legislation Eases Limits on Aliens*, N.Y.  
 22 Times (Feb. 2, 1990), <https://www.nytimes.com/1990/02/02/us/legislation-eases-limits-on-aliens.html> (“In yet another sign of diminishing world tensions, the Senate this week gave final  
 23 Congressional approval to repealing a provision of a McCarthy-era law that bars foreigners from  
 visiting the United States because of their political beliefs.”); *see also* ACLU, *The Excluded: Ideological Exclusion and the War on Ideas* at 6 (2007), <https://www.aclu.org/documents/excluded-ideological-exclusion-and-war-ideas>.

24 <sup>9</sup> *See* Ana Faguy, *US State Department revoked 6,000 student visas*, BBC (Aug. 18,  
 25 2025), <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/cz93vzndx07o>. Secretary of State Rubio has also  
 26 ordered diplomats overseas to scrutinize social media content of some applicants for student and  
 27 other types of visas, as well as some current visa holders, “in an effort to bar those suspected of  
 criticizing the United States and Israel from entering the country, U.S. officials say.” Edward  
 28 (continued...)

1 Consistent with Executive Order 14188, many of the revocations have focused on  
2 supporters of Palestinian rights on college campuses. As just one example, on March 25, plain-  
3 clothes Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) agents surrounded Rümeysa Öztürk—an  
4 international Ph.D. student at Tufts University—and took her into immigration custody, apparently  
5 for co-authoring an op-ed in the school newspaper. Other students have either been taken into ICE  
6 custody or self-deported after the revocation of their lawful status, all for expressing their support  
7 for Palestinian rights. *See* Complaint ¶¶ 40-64 (collecting cases). Each of these students was  
8 targeted for enforcement as part of a systematic effort by the Trump Administration—via the  
9 explicit directive of Executive Order 14188—to use federal immigration laws to punish noncitizen  
10 students (and others) associated with pro-Palestinian beliefs. *See Ozturk v. Hyde*, No. 1:25-cv-  
11 10695-DJC, 2025 WL 1009445, Doc. 42 at 7-8 (D. Mass. Mar. 28, 2025) (Casper, J.) (“Ozturk’s  
12 case is one of several cases in which the Trump Administration has implemented these Executive  
13 Orders by revoking the immigration status of non-citizens who expressed support for Palestine.”).  
14 In a typical case involving the revocation of a student visa it might have required lengthy discovery  
15 to uncover ICE’s viewpoint discrimination and retaliatory motive, but this Administration has made  
16 no effort to disguise the reasons for its actions. The Executive Orders themselves are explicit. And  
17 even before the inauguration, President Trump repeatedly threatened to deport any pro-Palestinian  
18 student protesters, saying: “Any student that protests, I [will] throw them out of the country.”<sup>10</sup> In  
19 the recent *AAUP v. Rubio* trial, evidence showed that special agents ordinarily reserved for sensitive  
20  
21  
22  
23

24 Wong, *Rubio Orders U.S. Diplomats to Scour Student Visa Applicants’ Social Media*, N.Y.  
25 Times (Mar. 25, 2025), [https://www.nytimes.com/2025/04/01/us/politics/student-visas-social-  
26 media.html](https://www.nytimes.com/2025/04/01/us/politics/student-visas-social-media.html). This new scrutiny appears to be tied to the start of the war in Gaza, as it applies to  
27 any applicants who previously held a student or exchange visa between October 7, 2023 and  
28 August 31, 2024, or had their visa terminated between October 7, 2023 and now. *Id.*

<sup>10</sup> Josh Dawsey, et al., *Trump told donors he will crush pro-Palestinian protests, deport demonstrators*, Washington Post (May 27, 2024), <https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/2024/05/27/trump-israel-gaza-policy-donors/>.

1 national security investigations were reassigned to carry out this campaign—effectively “rounding  
2 up campus protestors and op-ed writers” at universities.<sup>11</sup>

3 Senior members of the Administration have echoed the President’s ideological motive. For  
4 example, when asked about Öztürk’s detention, Secretary of State Marco Rubio announced the  
5 revocation of her visa, explaining, “we gave you a visa to come and study and get a degree, not to  
6 become a social activist that tears up our university campuses.”<sup>12</sup> There is no evidence that Öztürk  
7 “tore up” anything at Tufts; indeed, the only “open-source” reason for her arrest appears to be her  
8 authorship of an op-ed in her school newspaper—written with three fellow students and endorsed  
9 by 32 others—addressed to Tufts University administrators, arguing that their response to a  
10 resolution passed by student government concerning the war in Gaza had been inadequate.<sup>13</sup> Her  
11 visa revocation, arrest, and detention was a transparent attack on free speech.<sup>14</sup>

12  
13  
14 The aggressive tactics employed to enforce the ideological deportation policy lay bare its  
15 true intent: intimidating noncitizens into silence. A sudden loss of a visa or status may result in the  
16 individual being immediately deportable. But ICE is not merely initiating deportation proceedings.

17  
18 <sup>11</sup> *AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 137 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.).

19 <sup>12</sup> C-SPAN, *Secretary Rubio Defends Revoking Turkish Student’s Visa*, Mar. 27, 2025,  
<https://www.c-span.org/clip/news-conference/secretary-rubio-defends-revoking-turkish-students-visa/5158479>.

20 <sup>13</sup> See Rümeyşa Öztürk, et al., *Op-ed: Try again, President Kumar: Renewing calls for*  
21 *Tufts to adopt March 4 TCU Senate resolutions*, *The Tufts Daily* (Mar. 26, 2024),  
[www.tuftsdaily.com/article/2024/03/4ftk27sm6jkj](http://www.tuftsdaily.com/article/2024/03/4ftk27sm6jkj).

22 <sup>14</sup> The Ideological Deportation Policy may have started with those expressing pro-  
23 Palestinian beliefs, but it will not end with them. See Andy J. Semotiuk, *Silencing Dissent: U.S.*  
*Moves To Deport Kremlin Critic Kseniia Petrova*, *Forbes* (Mar. 30, 2025),  
24 <https://www.forbes.com/sites/andyjsemotiuk/2025/03/30/silencing-dissent-us-moves-to-deport-kremlin-critic-kseniia-petrova/>; Jack Healy & Jazmine Ulloa, *‘We Finally Got You.’ Immigrant-*  
25 *Rights Advocate Arrested in Colorado*, *N.Y. Times* (Mar. 18, 2025),  
<https://www.nytimes.com/2025/03/18/us/immigrant-arrest.html>; Eilis O’Neill, et al., *ICE detains*  
26 *leader of farmworker union in northwest Washington state*, *KUOW* (Mar. 26, 2025),  
<https://www.kuow.org/stories/ice-detains-farmworker-activist-in-northwest-washington-state>;  
27 Aurelien Breeden, *U.S. Turned Away French Scientist Over Views on Trump Policies*, *N.Y.*  
*Times* (Mar. 20, 2025), <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/03/20/world/europe/us-france-scientist-entry-trump-messages.html>.



1 Instead, ICE is resorting to alarming displays of power. Öztürk, for example, was walking to a  
 2 friend’s house to share a meal to end her Ramadan fast when she was physically restrained by six  
 3 plain-clothes federal officers (most of them masked), handcuffed, placed in an unmarked vehicle,  
 4 and quickly driven away and out of state.<sup>15</sup> These dramatic actions were neither required to advance  
 5 national security nor justified by any conceivable risk the student posed. Rather, the point *is* fear.  
 6 The calculated use of the arrest power and arbitrary detention thousands of miles away from their  
 7 homes sends a powerful message: the federal government seeks to punish noncitizens for exercising  
 8 their constitutionally protected speech and to instill pervasive fear that suppresses dissent.<sup>16</sup> Indeed,  
 9

10  
 11 <sup>15</sup> Öztürk was seized at 5:49 P.M. in Somerville, Massachusetts, about 15 miles from the  
 12 nearest ICE Field Office in Burlington, Massachusetts. *See* Decl. of Acting Deputy Field Office  
 13 Director David T. Wesling, *Ozturk v. Trump*, No. 1:25-cv-10695-DJC, Doc. 19-1 at ¶ 10 (D.  
 14 Mass. Apr. 4, 2025). But she was taken to Lebanon, New Hampshire within an hour of her arrest  
 15 (at 6:36 P.M.). She then sat in Lebanon for two and a half hours, *id.* at ¶¶ 11-12, before being  
 16 processed at the ICE Field Office in St. Albans, Vermont, over 230 miles from Somerville. *Id.* at  
 17 ¶¶ 12-13. The government claims that this circuitous route was followed because of “operational  
 18 necessity and considerations.” *Id.* at ¶ 7. The next day Öztürk was flown to Louisiana, where she  
 19 was detained. *Id.* at ¶ 18. *See Ozturk v. Hyde*, 2025 WL 1009445, Doc. 42 at 18-22 (Casper, J.)  
 20 (citing the government’s “furtiveness” and the “irregularity” of her transfer process “coupled with  
 21 the failure to disclose Ozturk’s whereabouts even after the government was aware that she had  
 22 counsel and the Petition was filed in this Court”). Overall, Öztürk was detained from March 25<sup>th</sup>  
 23 to May 9<sup>th</sup>, when she was ordered released pending a final decision on her legal challenge to her  
 24 detention. *See Ozturk v. Trump*, 2025 WL 1355667 (May 9, 2025).

25 <sup>16</sup> These ideological deportations are just one of many actions taken by the Trump  
 26 Administration meant to terrify immigrants across the country. It has admitted to deporting at  
 27 least one person in error, taken a Massachusetts defendant from state court mid-trial, and bragged  
 28 about shipping noncitizens en masse to a “notoriously brutal” prison in El Salvador where they  
 will “face immediate and intentional life-threatening harm” and “egregious human rights abuses.”  
*Trump v. J.G.G.*, 604 U.S. \_\_\_, 2025 WL 1024097 (2025) (Sotomayor, J., dissenting). The  
 Administration has also been accused of ignoring federal court orders meant to ensure noncitizens  
 receive due process; it has argued that even when it does make a mistake, it cannot retrieve  
 people from the foreign prisons to which it sends them. *See id.* Recently, in Chicago, federal  
 immigration agents have used chemical agents near a public school and deployed a helicopter  
 during an enforcement action at a five-story apartment building. *See* Sophia Tareen, *Using*  
*helicopters and chemical agents, immigration agents become increasingly aggressive in Chicago*,  
 AP News (Oct. 6, 2025), <https://apnews.com/article/chicago-immigration-federal-arrests-helicopter-trump-ice-8dbf688f78f3b6d1b8fdb989557b28c4>. These actions have had their  
 intended effect. *See generally* M. Gessen, *Unmarked Vans. Secret Lists. Public Denunciations. Our Police State Has Arrived.*, N.Y. Times (Apr. 2, 2025),

(continued...)

1 the *AAUP* Court confirmed as much, concluding that “ICE goes masked for a single reason—to  
 2 terrorize Americans into quiescence.”<sup>17</sup> The Administration’s actions reflect the unconstitutional  
 3 use of immigration enforcement to deport noncitizens for expressing opinions with which the  
 4 government disagrees, and its aggressive tactics are designed precisely to instill fear and stifle  
 5 dissent.

6  
 7 This campaign of ideological deportations has now been resoundingly repudiated in court.  
 8 After a nine-day bench trial, the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts ruled  
 9 in *AAUP v. Rubio* that the Administration’s policy of arresting, detaining, and deporting noncitizen  
 10 students for their campus advocacy violates the First Amendment.<sup>18</sup> The Court held that the  
 11 defendants (the same defendants as in this case)—Secretaries Rubio and Noem—acted  
 12 intentionally “to chill the rights to freedom of speech and peacefully to assemble of the non-citizen  
 13 plaintiff members of the plaintiff associations.”<sup>19</sup> The ruling underscores that the First Amendment  
 14 draws no line between citizens and lawfully present noncitizens when it comes to core political  
 15 speech.<sup>20</sup> That principle guides Amici States’ arguments here.

17 **B. Noncitizen Residents, Students, and Faculty Benefit Amici States**

18 Noncitizen residents contribute substantially to the economic, cultural, and intellectual  
 19 vitality of Amici States. In their communities, these residents generate significant tax revenue, fill  
 20 critical workforce gaps, and start businesses that create jobs. In the educational context,  
 21

22 <https://www.nytimes.com/2025/04/02/opinion/trump-ice-immigrants.html> (“It’s the chilling  
 23 stories that come by word of mouth. ICE is checking documents on the subway. ICE is outside  
 24 New York public libraries that hold English-as-a-second-language classes. ICE agents handcuffed  
 25 a U.S. citizen who tried to intervene in a detention in Harlem. ICE vehicles are parked outside  
 26 Columbia. ICE is coming to your workplace, your street, your building. ICE agents are wearing  
 brown uniforms that resemble those of UPS—don’t open the door for deliveries. Don’t leave the  
 house. The streets in the New York neighborhoods with the highest immigrant populations have  
 emptied out.”).

27 <sup>17</sup> *AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 98 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.).

<sup>18</sup> *See AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.).

<sup>19</sup> *Id.* at 5.

<sup>20</sup> *Id.* at 3.

1 international students and faculty enrich campus life through their diverse perspectives and  
2 contributions to innovation and research advancements that help maintain the competitiveness and  
3 prestige of our colleges and universities. Their presence deepens relationships and ties that create  
4 long-term advantages for Amici States' economic development, cultural enrichment, and  
5 international standing.

6  
7 Noncitizen residents contribute to the Amici States' economies, labor forces, and  
8 communities in several important ways. Immigrant-led households in Massachusetts, for example,  
9 earned over 15% of all income earned in the Commonwealth in 2014.<sup>21</sup> "With those earnings, the  
10 state's foreign-born households were able to contribute more than one in every seven dollars paid  
11 by Massachusetts residents in state and local tax revenues, payments that support important public  
12 services such as public schools and police."<sup>22</sup> Immigrants make up a large portion of the  
13 Massachusetts labor force (21.9%) and a disproportionate share of the Commonwealth's  
14 entrepreneurs (27%), STEM workers (29.3%), and health aides (38.6%).<sup>23</sup> California has over  
15 880,000 immigrant entrepreneurs, who contribute \$28.4 billion in business income; 28 Fortune 500  
16 companies in California were founded by immigrants or the children of immigrants.<sup>24</sup> Simply put,  
17 the contributions of these residents strengthen our states' fiscal health and global competitiveness.  
18

19  
20  
21 <sup>21</sup> New American Economy, *The Contributions of New Americans in Massachusetts* (Aug.  
22 2016), <https://research.newamericaneconomy.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/nae-ma-report.pdf>.  
23 Note that 53% of immigrants in Massachusetts are naturalized citizens. See American  
24 Immigration Council, *New Americans in Massachusetts* (2023),  
25 <https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/massachusetts/> (last visited Oct. 7, 2025).

26 <sup>22</sup> *The Contributions of New Americans in Massachusetts*, *supra* note 21.

27 <sup>23</sup> *The Contributions of New Americans in Massachusetts*, *supra* note 21. See generally,  
28 Aidan Enright, et al., *International Students: Poorly Suited Immigration Pathways Stymie  
Formation of High Growth Businesses* 4, Pioneer Institute, (July 2024),  
<https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED656349.pdf> ("A significant body of research has found that  
immigrants are more likely to start businesses than those born in the U.S., and the propensity of  
international students to concentrate in STEM fields indicates enormous potential for economic  
contributions.").

<sup>24</sup> American Immigration Council, *Immigrants in California*, <https://map.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/locations/california/> (last visited Oct. 7, 2025).

1 In the community, noncitizens revitalize neighborhoods by introducing diverse arts, cuisine, and  
 2 traditions that strengthen community bonds.<sup>25</sup> In healthcare settings, noncitizen professionals often  
 3 provide care to medically underserved communities and bridge critical language gaps.<sup>26</sup> The  
 4 presence of noncitizens promotes multilingualism and cultural competency among native-born  
 5 residents, preparing future generations for success in an increasingly interconnected world.<sup>27</sup>  
 6

7 Beyond these economic and community impacts, noncitizen residents are vital to the  
 8 success of Amici States' academic institutions. International students and faculty are invaluable  
 9 members of our campus communities. During the 2023 to 2024 school year, Amici States hosted  
 10 nearly 640,000 international students who supported more than 235,000 jobs and contributed  
 11 approximately \$27.5 billion annually to our economies through tuition, living expenses, and related  
 12 spending.<sup>28</sup> These students and faculty members bring diverse perspectives that enhance Amici  
 13

14  
 15 <sup>25</sup> See Americans for the Arts, *Arts Impact Explorer Fact Sheet: Arts + Immigration* (July 2024), <https://ww2.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/2025-01/Arts%20%2B%20Immigration.pdf> (noting that “[f]ifty-seven percent of Americans believe that immigrants improve the quality of the food, music, and arts in the United States”).  
 16  
 17

18 <sup>26</sup> See Morhaf Al Achkar, et al., *Integrating Immigrant Health Professionals into the U.S. Healthcare Workforce: Barriers and Solutions*, J. Immigr. Minor Health, (Apr. 2023), <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC10119818/> (“Immigrant health professionals play essential roles in today’s health system. Not only do immigrant health professionals help relieve workforce shortages, especially in under-resourced areas, they also bring awareness of and sensitivities to the needs and health challenges of their communities.”); L.E. Gomez & Patrick Bernet, *Diversity improves performance and outcomes*, 111 J. Nat’l Med. Ass’n 383, 391 (Aug. 2019), <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0027968418303584?via%3Dihub> (compiling research on the healthcare industry and concluding that “[d]iversity can help organizations improve both patient care quality and financial results”).  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22

23 <sup>27</sup> See, e.g., Brian D. Smedly, et al., Institute of Medicine (US) Committee on Understanding and Eliminating Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Health Care, *Unequal Treatment: Confronting Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Healthcare*, at 123 (2003), [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK220358/pdf/Bookshelf\\_NBK220358.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK220358/pdf/Bookshelf_NBK220358.pdf), (“Racial and ethnic diversity of health professions faculty and students helps to ensure that all students will develop the cultural competencies necessary for treating patients in an increasingly diverse nation.”).  
 24  
 25  
 26

27 <sup>28</sup> See NAFSA: Association of International Educators, *NAFSA International Student Economic Value Tool* (2023-24), <https://www.nafsa.org/policy-and-advocacy/policy-resources/nafsa-international-student-economic-value-tool-v2> (last visited Oct. 7, 2025).  
 28

1 States' educational environments, with international students and scholars fostering global  
2 awareness and cross-cultural understanding in classrooms and research settings.<sup>29</sup> For many  
3 students, campus life is the first time they are living with and studying alongside students from  
4 different countries and cultures. These interactions expand students' worldviews, build cultural  
5 empathy, and help develop them into global leaders.

7 Amici States' public colleges and universities are deeply committed to global engagement,  
8 partnering with international counterparts to facilitate research projects and academic programs all  
9 over the world. UMass Amherst alone has partnerships in 36 countries.<sup>30</sup> The University of  
10 Washington has over 200 partnerships spanning 47 countries.<sup>31</sup> Public colleges and universities in  
11 Amici States have intentionally fostered these connections because international collaboration  
12 benefits communities at the local, national, and international level.<sup>32</sup> Amici States' public colleges  
13 and universities also have a long tradition of hosting foreign students and scholars. These programs  
14 reflect the reciprocal benefits conferred by foreign exchange: Amici States gain and grow  
15 economically, socially, and culturally from the presence of noncitizen students and faculty while  
16 the international community benefits immensely by the knowledge-sharing and global problem-  
17 solving these exchanges allow.

---

20 <sup>29</sup> Empirical research suggests that academic performance improves as the  
21 percentage of immigrant students increases. See Paul N'Dri Konan, et al., *Cultural Diversity in*  
22 *the Classroom and its Effects on Academic Performance: A Cross-National Perspective*, 41 Soc.  
23 Psych. 230-37 (2010); see also Judit Kende, et al., *Social and institutional inclusion in*  
24 *multi-ethnic schools enable better intergroup relations for majority youth and higher school*  
25 *achievement for minority youth*, 103 Int'l J. of Intercultural Rels. (Nov. 2024),  
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0147176724001573>; Diana F. Yefanova, et  
26 al., *Instructional Practices Facilitating Cross-National Interactions in Undergraduate Classes*, 7  
27 J. of Int'l Students 786 (2017).

28 <sup>30</sup> UMass Amherst, *Global Partnerships*, <https://www.umass.edu/global-affairs/global-partnerships> (last visited Oct. 7, 2025).

<sup>31</sup> See University of Washington, *A Global University*, <https://www.washington.edu/global/> (last visited Oct. 7, 2025).

<sup>32</sup> See, e.g., University of Illinois System, *International Partnerships*,  
[https://www.uiillinois.edu/about/international\\_partnerships](https://www.uiillinois.edu/about/international_partnerships).

1 In short, noncitizen residents are indispensable to Amici States. They contribute  
2 significantly to local economies and launch businesses that create jobs for citizens and noncitizens  
3 alike. They advance research that addresses pressing challenges. They are drivers of innovation and  
4 entrepreneurship. They are neighbors, friends, and pillars of our communities. The benefits they  
5 afford the Amici States cannot be overstated.  
6

7 **III. The Ideological Deportation Policy Inflicts Severe and Irreparable Harm on Amici  
8 States and is Contrary to the Public Interest**

9 The Administration's policy of ideological visa revocations and deportations violates the  
10 First Amendment as a matter of law. There is no genuine dispute that Defendants have used  
11 immigration authority to punish individuals with lawful status for their political expression and  
12 associations. The record—including the Executive Orders' express text, the Administration's own  
13 public statements, and the federal government's pattern of enforcement—demonstrates that the  
14 policy's purpose and effect are to suppress speech disfavored by the current Administration.

15 State universities, public colleges, and research institutions in the Amici States have already  
16 and will continue to suffer concrete harm: international students and scholars have been silenced,  
17 academic collaborations disrupted, and campus publications forced to curtail coverage out of fear  
18 that protected expression will trigger immigration reprisals. The Ideological Deportation Policy  
19 also harms Amici States' public safety, public health, and religious worship. Amici States therefore  
20 support declaratory and injunctive relief to restore the conditions of free inquiry and expression  
21 that the First Amendment guarantees and that the States depend upon to sustain their educational  
22 and civic missions.  
23

24 **A. If Not Enjoined, the Ideological Deportation Policy Will Continue to Inflict  
25 Educational and Institutional Harm on Colleges and Universities Within  
26 Amici States**

27 When noncitizen students and faculty face potential deportation based on their expressed  
28 viewpoints, every aspect of the academic ecosystem is damaged. Classroom discussions become



1 artificially constrained, as international participants either stop attending altogether or self-censor  
2 to avoid expressing perspectives on issues that might be deemed controversial, especially on topics  
3 of public interest and import. In fact, speech on topics of public interest enjoys greater constitutional  
4 protection, not less.<sup>33</sup> That heightened protection is most necessary in the classroom, where  
5 students must challenge one another’s assumptions, broaden one another’s perspectives, and  
6 ultimately educate one another through the collision of diverse viewpoints.<sup>34</sup> That is why the First  
7 Amendment simply “does not tolerate laws that cast a pall of orthodoxy over the classroom”  
8 because “[t]he classroom is peculiarly the ‘marketplace of ideas.’” *Keyishian v. Bd. of Regents of*  
9 *Univ. of State of N.Y.*, 385 U.S. 589, 603 (1967) (citation omitted).

11 By punishing protected expression, the Ideological Deportation Policy defrauds that  
12 marketplace and degrades the educational experience: from one of authentic intellectual exploration  
13 to a stilted performance where certain voices remain deliberately silent. Student organizations,  
14 publications, and campus activism—all training grounds for democratic participation—are now  
15 divided between students who can speak freely and those who cannot (because they fear retaliation  
16 under the Ideological Deportation Policy). This division creates a separate and unequal educational  
17 environment, including at Amici States’ public colleges and universities, in which some students  
18 can participate in campus life and develop their intellectual identities while others fear reprisal for  
19 expressing certain (protected) viewpoints. Where even a small number of students self-censor, the  
20 educational experience for all suffers.<sup>35</sup> This harm is exacerbated by the arbitrariness of the

23 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 <sup>33</sup> See *Snyder v. Phelps*, 562 U.S. 443, 452 (2011) (“[S]peech on public issues occupies  
25 the highest rung of the hierarchy of First Amendment values, and is entitled to special  
26 protection.” (citation omitted)).

26 <sup>34</sup> See, e.g., Mission of the California State University, [https://www.calstate.edu/csu-  
27 system/about-the-csu/Pages/mission.aspx](https://www.calstate.edu/csu-system/about-the-csu/Pages/mission.aspx) (last visited Oct. 7, 2025) (“[T]he California State  
28 University . . . [e]ncourages free scholarly inquiry and protects the University as a forum for the  
discussion and critical examination of ideas, findings, and conclusions.”).

<sup>35</sup> For example, after witnessing the first arrests under this policy, one international

(continued...)



1 government’s Ideological Deportation Policy.<sup>36</sup> Though crystal clear in its ideological and  
2 censorial nature, the policy does not specify what particular views will subject students to it.

3 Beyond the classroom, “[s]cholarship cannot flourish in an atmosphere of suspicion and  
4 distrust.” *Sweezy v. State of N.H. ex rel. Wyman*, 354 U.S. 234, 250 (1957). Academic inquiry is  
5 compromised when scholars must weigh immigration consequences alongside intellectual pursuits.  
6 International academics might abandon promising areas of research, decline to challenge prevailing  
7 orthodoxies, or temper their findings to avoid conclusions that might be dissatisfactory to the  
8 federal government.<sup>37</sup> Such constraints will stifle innovation. The rapid development of COVID-  
9 19 vaccines, for example, illustrates the importance of open dialogue to scientific achievement, as  
10 “[r]esearchers developed ad hoc research collaborations across disciplines, institutions and  
11 borders.”<sup>38</sup> Universities played an important role in that global effort.<sup>39</sup> Self-censorship also  
12 undermines the peer review process, which depends on honest and robust critique. And academic  
13 conferences—essential for the exchange of ideas on campuses—lose their vitality when  
14

15  
16  
17 \_\_\_\_\_  
18 professor testified at the *AAUP v. Rubio* trial that he “decided on a blanket policy” to “keep his  
19 head down completely,” vowing he “would not go to protests . . . not write . . . not sign on to  
20 public letters” anymore. He even canceled travel to see his terminally ill brother, rather than risk  
drawing attention to himself. *AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 77-78 (Sept. 30,  
2025) (D. Mass.). As this example illustrates, the policy is silencing scholars and students,  
diminishing the free exchange of ideas on campus.

21 <sup>36</sup> See *Cramp v. Bd. of Pub. Instruction of Orange Cnty.*, 368 U.S. 278, 287 (1961) (“The  
vice of unconstitutional vagueness is further aggravated where, as here, the [policy] . . . inhibit[s]  
the exercise of individual freedoms affirmatively protected by the Constitution.”).

22 <sup>37</sup> See Miri Yemini, *Bridging Borders: Toward Equity in International Research*  
23 *Collaborations* NAFSA (Nov./Dec. 2024), [https://www.nafsa.org/professional-resources/  
research-and-trends/trends-insights/bridging-borders-novdec24](https://www.nafsa.org/professional-resources/research-and-trends/trends-insights/bridging-borders-novdec24) (“International research  
24 collaborations have become essential tools in advancing knowledge, offering benefits to  
researchers, practitioners, higher education institutions, nation-states, international organizations,  
25 and funding agencies.”).

26 <sup>38</sup> Chris Yiu, et al., *A research and policy agenda for the post-pandemic world*, *Future*  
*Healthcare J.* (July 2021), <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC8285152/>.

27 <sup>39</sup> See John P. Moore & Ian A. Wilson, *Decades of basic research paved the way*  
*for today’s ‘warp speed’ Covid-19 vaccines*, *Stat* (Jan. 5, 2021), [https://www.statnews.com/  
28 2021/01/05/basic-research-paved-way-for-warp-speed-covid-19-vaccines/](https://www.statnews.com/2021/01/05/basic-research-paved-way-for-warp-speed-covid-19-vaccines/) (noting that the  
technology used in the vaccines “emerged during the past decade from university laboratories”).

1 international participants must either cancel or temper their contributions. Spontaneous exchanges  
2 are replaced with sanitized interactions. This not only deprives the academic community of diverse  
3 insights but also sends a message that certain perspectives are unwelcome as part of the intellectual  
4 discourse on college campuses within Amici States.

5  
6 Censorship thus threatens the First Amendment rights of both speaker and audience, as  
7 “[t]he right of freedom of speech . . . necessarily protects the right to receive it.” *Martin v. City of*  
8 *Struthers*, 319 U.S. 141, 143 (1943). Indeed, this is precisely the reason why “[v]iewpoint  
9 discrimination is . . . an egregious form of content discrimination” and “[t]he government *must*  
10 abstain from regulating speech when the specific motivating ideology or the opinion or perspective  
11 of the speaker is the rationale for the restriction.” *Rosenberger v. Rector & Visitors of Univ. of Va.*,  
12 515 U.S. 819, 829 (1995) (emphasis added). That holds true whether those viewpoint-based  
13 restrictions on protected speech are achieved through explicit government censorship, a deliberately  
14 ambiguous enforcement policy, or the more insidious mechanism of selective vulnerability of the  
15 speaker to government retaliation.

16  
17 Here, the ambiguity of the Ideological Deportation Policy deepens its chilling effect. For  
18 example, Secretary of State Rubio’s diplomatic cable requiring enhanced social media vetting  
19 procedures for certain visa holders and applicants (referenced *supra* note 9) tells diplomats to look  
20 for “conduct that bears a hostile attitude toward U.S. citizens or U.S. culture (including government,  
21 institutions, or founding principles).”<sup>40</sup> The astonishing breadth of this description of the speech  
22 prohibited—which readily includes *any* criticism of “U.S. citizens or U.S. culture”—combined  
23 with the government’s relentless assertion of pretexts every time it enforces the policy, has left its  
24 contours completely ill-defined. And “[u]ncertain meanings inevitably lead citizens to steer far  
25

26  
27  
28 <sup>40</sup> Marisa Kabas, *State Dept. demands ‘enhanced’ social media vetting of student visa applicants*, The Handbasket (Mar. 26, 2025), <https://www.thehandbasket.co/p/state-dept-enhanced-social-media-vetting-student-visa-applicants>.

1 wider of the unlawful zone than if the boundaries of the forbidden areas were clearly marked.”  
 2 *Grayned v. City of Rockford*, 408 U.S. 104, 109 (1972) (cleaned up). In the face of such ambiguity,  
 3 noncitizen students and faculty are left to guess at what speech might trigger their deportation,  
 4 creating a chilling effect on speech and scholarship that extends far beyond what even the policy  
 5 itself might have been intended to proscribe. Here, that repressive chill is especially profound  
 6 because speakers may face punishment as grave as deportation, which can mean the loss “of all that  
 7 makes life worth living.” *Ng Fung Ho v. White*, 259 U.S. 276, 284 (1922). Indeed, for these reasons,  
 8 the *AAUP* Court recognized that the ideological deportation policy “would cause a reasonable  
 9 would-be speaker to self-censor, such that the challenged policy objectively chills protected  
 10 expression.”<sup>41</sup>

12 Although these harms derive from core First Amendment principles, they are not abstract.  
 13 International students and faculty across Amici States fear the Ideological Deportation Policy,  
 14 leading to censorship in their expression, studies, and research.<sup>42</sup> According to a declaration filed  
 15

17 <sup>41</sup> *AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 115 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.)  
 18 (citations omitted).

19 <sup>42</sup> Countless news articles have documented this chilling effect. *See* Emma Johnson,  
 20 ‘SCARED TO LEAVE MY HOUSE’ Mavericks react to ICE-detained student, what’s being done,  
 21 The Reporter (Apr. 8, 2025), <https://www.msureporter.com/2025/04/08/scared-to-leave-my-house/>;  
 22 Anvee Bhutani, *US student journalists go dark fearing Trump crusade against pro-Palestinian speech*,  
 23 The Guardian (Apr. 7, 2025), <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2025/apr/07/student-journalists-remove-stories-trump>;  
 24 Jeff Tollefson, *International PhD students make emergency plans in fear of US immigration raids*,  
 25 Nature (Apr. 4, 2025), <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-025-01056-5>;  
 26 Lexi Lonas Cochran, *Trump crackdown casts chill over international student programs*,  
 27 The Hill (Apr. 3, 2025), <https://thehill.com/homenews/education/5226292-trump-immigration-crackdown-international-students-college-campus-protests-ice-rubio-deportation-khalil/>;  
 28 Benjamin Bardman, *Trump Immigration Actions are Likely to Have a Chilling Effect on Online Speech*,  
 Vanderbilt J. of Ent. & Tech. L. (Mar. 31, 2025), <https://www.vanderbilt.edu/jetlaw/2025/03/31/trump-immigration-actions/>;  
 Olivia Ebertz, *Deportations and detainments are having a chilling effect at Brown*,  
 Rhode Island PBS (Mar. 27, 2025), <https://thepublicradio.org/education/deportations-and-detainments-are-having-a-chilling-effect-at-brown/>;  
 Liam Knox, *‘Palpable Fear’ Hangs Over International Students*,  
 Inside Higher Ed (Mar. 18, 2025), <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/18/international-students-navigate-escalating-threats>.

1 by Tufts University in support of Rümeyşa Öztürk’s habeas petition, “[t]he University has heard  
2 from students, faculty and staff who are forgoing opportunities to speak at international conferences  
3 and avoiding or postponing international travel. In the worst cases, many report being fearful of  
4 leaving their homes, even to attend and teach classes on campus.”<sup>43</sup> Similarly, at some  
5 Massachusetts state colleges and universities faculty members have decided not to attend  
6 international conferences out of fear of re-entry denial, and at least one international panelist has  
7 withdrawn from a domestic conference. International students report that they are afraid to speak  
8 up in class out of concern that they will be reported to ICE; others have asked to attend classes  
9 virtually to reduce the possibility of contact with ICE; and some are so afraid that they have chosen  
10 to withdraw from their classes altogether and relocate. Student groups have stopped hosting events  
11 for fear that individual student members might be targeted. When events do go forward,  
12 Massachusetts schools have seen a noticeable decline in international student attendance. Doctoral  
13 students have requested that their dissertations be embargoed and shielded from public release out  
14 of fear that their topic of study will be used as a basis for ideologically-based immigration action.  
15 University of Washington officials report that this anxiety extends even to noncitizen medical  
16 trainees who are concerned about their ability to continue training in the United States or obtain  
17 future positions due to immigration changes. And in New York, State University of New York  
18 (SUNY) institutions report a reduced willingness among international scholars to teach, engage in  
19 public discourse at SUNY, or participate in any United States-based research. As visa revocations  
20 continue across the Amici States every day, these chilling effects continue to multiply.  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

---

27 <sup>43</sup> See Tufts University, *University Declaration for Rümeyşa Öztürk* (Apr. 2, 2025),  
28 <https://www.tufts.edu/president/speeches-and-messages/04022025-university-declaration-for-rumeysa-ozturk>.

1 If international students and faculty are afraid to speak freely in the United States, they will  
2 not want to come here. The perception (and reality) of ideological targeting undermines the  
3 essential academic freedom that has historically made the United States a global beacon. Talented  
4 scholars will instead now view our country as an unpredictable and potentially hostile educational  
5 environment, driving them toward opportunities in peer countries with more inclusive policies.<sup>44</sup>  
6 Indeed, a number of public colleges and universities in Amici States are already experiencing  
7 significant declines in enrollment interest from international students as compared to 2024. For  
8 example, one Massachusetts public university estimates—based on analysis undertaken since the  
9 challenged policy went into effect—that there will be a 21% drop in prospective international  
10 students for the 2025 to 2026 academic year. Another reports that completed applications for first-  
11 year international students are down 12%. SUNY institutions are reporting similarly significant  
12 declines in international applications, visa approvals, and continued enrollment by students. One  
13 SUNY campus is reporting a significant reduction in new and continuing international enrollments  
14 in its Master’s degree programs for the Fall 2025 semester as compared to the same date last year.  
15 These recruitment and retention challenges will result in a “brain drain” from the United States that  
16 will reverberate through our economy and society.<sup>45</sup> The exodus of current talent means a loss of  
17 future innovation. If allowed to continue, the Ideological Deportation Policy will create a legacy of  
18 international distrust that could take generations to repair.

19 Our schools themselves will be devastated. The loss of prospective students—and current  
20 students who abandon their studies—will severely weaken American universities’ global  
21  
22  
23  
24

25 \_\_\_\_\_  
26 <sup>44</sup> See Liam Knox, *International Enrollment’s Precarious Moment*, Inside Higher Ed  
(Mar. 19, 2025), <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/03/19/colleges-fear-decline-international-student>.

27 <sup>45</sup> Robin Hattersley, *Visa Revocations Leave Hundreds of International College Students*  
28 *in Limbo*, Campus Safety Magazine (Apr. 8, 2025), <https://www.campussafetymagazine.com/news/visa-revocations-leave-international-college-students-in-limbo/169053/>.

1 competitiveness, research capabilities, and financial stability. As discussed *supra*, international  
 2 students contribute billions of dollars annually to the U.S. economy while bringing unique  
 3 perspectives to the classroom that enrich the educational experience for everyone. Loss of these  
 4 contributions will cause declining research output, diminished global rankings, and significant  
 5 budget shortfalls that could trigger program cuts, reduce scholarships, and increase tuition (for  
 6 native and international students alike).<sup>46</sup> The Ideological Deportation Policy will also jeopardize  
 7 existing international collaborations, study abroad programs, and faculty exchange initiatives—as  
 8 it already has—because partner institutions in other countries will hesitate to engage with a system  
 9 where students or faculty fear speaking their minds. The long-term consequence will be  
 10 catastrophic: the erosion of America’s position as a global leader in higher education.<sup>47</sup>

11  
 12 **B. If Not Enjoined, The Ideological Deportation Policy Will Continue To Harm  
 13 Public Safety, Public Health, and Religious Worship in Amici States**

14 The threat of ideological deportation extends beyond academia and free speech, impacting  
 15 other vital public interests—such as public health, public safety, and free religious worship.

16 From a public safety perspective, the Ideological Deportation Policy will cause noncitizens  
 17 to avoid cooperating with law enforcement if they fear deportation, hampering crime reporting,

18  
 19  
 20 

---

 21 <sup>46</sup> See Liam Knox, *Student Visa Dragnet Reaches Small Colleges*, Inside Higher Ed  
 22 (Apr. 8, 2025), [https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-  
 23 us/2025/04/08/trump-admin-broadens-scope-student-visa](https://www.insidehighered.com/news/global/international-students-us/2025/04/08/trump-admin-broadens-scope-student-visa) (“Many of the small colleges struggling  
 24 to respond to student visa revocations have come to rely on international tuition dollars to support  
 25 flagging revenue from shrinking domestic enrollment or declines in state funding.”).

26 <sup>47</sup> The short-term consequence has been chaos on campuses across Amici States.  
 27 Specifically, institutions of higher education are expending significant time and effort attempting  
 28 to advise and support noncitizen students and faculty. For example, colleges and universities are:  
 advising individual students about possible changes to their academic plans due to actual or  
 potential changes in visa status, reviewing students’ visa statuses more frequently than usual to  
 determine which students may be at risk, attempting to understand the federal government’s  
 evolving visa requirements, and responding to increased mental health concerns (e.g., anxiety)  
 associated with uncertainty about individuals’ continued presence in the United States. Individual  
 institutions have likely spent hundreds of personnel hours attempting to navigate these issues—  
 time that is taken away from managing the regular operations of a campus including, but not  
 limited to, instruction.

1 witness participation, and community policing.<sup>48</sup> From a public health perspective, Amici States  
2 depend on noncitizen healthcare workers who, like other immigrants, are forced to live in a climate  
3 of fear—nationwide over one million immigrants work in healthcare, including 40% of home health  
4 aides and 18% of nursing home staff.<sup>49</sup> Finally, the Ideological Deportation Policy undermines  
5 religious worship, as many religious beliefs have ideological components. Freedom of worship  
6 requires free speech: the right to articulate beliefs, share religious teachings, and conduct  
7 discussions. Religious freedom would be nullified if certain religious beliefs become grounds for  
8 deportation or exclusion. Noncitizens will hesitate to speak freely at (or even attend) religious  
9 ceremonies. Houses of worship—historically sanctuaries for honest expression—will become  
10 spaces of suspicion and fear, particularly affecting minority religious groups. When free expression  
11 is attacked, many aspects of the public interest suffer alongside it.

12  
13  
14 In sum, the Ideological Deportation Policy has echoed across nearly all domains in Amici  
15 States. This Court should enjoin a policy that will make our states less safe, less healthy, and less  
16 free.

#### 17 **IV. Conclusion**

18 The stakes here are best summarized by the words of the District Court in its *AAUP*  
19 decision: “the judicial role is limited to safeguarding the rights of all persons lawfully present in  
20 this country. This includes the freedom of speech that allows those persons to understand each other  
21

---

22  
23  
24 <sup>48</sup> Meg Anderson, *Police say ICE Tactics are eroding public trust in local law*  
25 *enforcement*, NPR (Mar. 30, 2025), <https://www.npr.org/2025/03/30/nx-s1-5304236/police-say-ice-tactics-are-eroding-public-trust-in-local-law-enforcement>.

26 <sup>49</sup> Nicole Lou, *Over 350K Health Workers Face Deportation Risk*, MedPageToday.com  
27 (Apr. 3, 2025), <https://www.medpagetoday.com/publichealthpolicy/workforce/114947>; Vanessa  
28 G. Sánchez & Daniel Chang, *Immigration crackdowns disrupt caregivers. Families are paying the price.*, NBC News (Apr. 3, 2025), <https://www.nbcnews.com/health/health-news/trump-immigration-crackdowns-threaten-health-caregiving-us-families-rcna199383>.



1 and to debate. ... We are not, and we must not become, a nation that imprisons and deports people  
2 because we are afraid of what they have to tell us.”<sup>50</sup>

3 For the foregoing reasons, this Court should grant Plaintiffs’ motion for summary judgment  
4 and grant injunctive and declaratory relief.

5  
6  
7 Respectfully submitted,

8 NICHOLAS W. BROWN  
9 *Attorney General*  
10 *State of Washington*

ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL  
*Attorney General*  
*Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

11 /s/ Cristina Sepe  
12 Cristina Sepe, WSBA 53609, CA 308023  
13 Marsha Chien, WSBA 47020  
14 Kelly A. Paradis, WSBA 47175  
15 *Deputy Solicitors General*  
16 1125 Washington Street SE  
17 PO Box 40100  
18 Olympia, WA 98504-0100  
19 360-753-6200

Tasha J. Bahal, BBO 675935  
*Deputy State Solicitor*  
David Rassoul Rangaviz, BBO 681430  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
*Civil Rights Division*  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108  
617-963-2816  
david.rangaviz@mass.gov

20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

ROB BONTA  
*Attorney General*  
*State of California*  
Michael Newman, CA 222993  
*Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
Marissa Malouff, CA 316046  
*Supervising Deputy Attorney General*  
Jennifer Soliman, CA 332519  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
300 S. Spring St., Suite 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013  
213-269-6596  
Jennifer.Soliman@doj.ca.gov

<sup>50</sup> *AAUP v. Rubio*, No. 1:25-cv-10685, Doc. 261 at 145 (Sept. 30, 2025) (D. Mass.).

1 KRIS MAYES  
2 *Attorney General*  
3 *State of Arizona*  
4 2005 N. Central Ave.  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85004

6 PHILIP J. WEISER  
7 *Attorney General*  
8 *State of Colorado*  
9 1300 Broadway  
10 Denver, CO 80203

11 WILLIAM TONG  
12 *Attorney General*  
13 *State of Connecticut*  
14 165 Capitol Avenue  
15 Hartford, CT 06106

16 KATHLEEN JENNINGS  
17 *Attorney General*  
18 *State of Delaware*  
19 Delaware Department of Justice  
20 820 N. French Street  
21 Wilmington, DE 19801

22 BRIAN L. SCHWALB  
23 *Attorney General*  
24 *District of Columbia*  
25 400 6th Street, NW, Suite 8100  
26 Washington, DC 20001

27 ANNE E. LOPEZ  
28 *Attorney General*  
*State of Hawai'i*  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813

KWAME RAOUL  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Illinois*  
115 South LaSalle Street  
Chicago, IL 60603

AARON M. FREY  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Maine*  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333-0006

ANTHONY G. BROWN  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Maryland*  
200 Saint Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202

DANA NESSEL  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Michigan*  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909

KEITH ELLISON  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Minnesota*  
102 State Capitol  
75 Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.  
St. Paul, MN 55155

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN  
*Attorney General*  
*State of New Jersey*  
Richard J. Hughes Justice Complex  
25 Market Street  
Trenton, NJ 08625

RAÚL TORREZ  
*Attorney General*  
*State of New Mexico*  
New Mexico Department of Justice  
408 Galisteo Street  
Santa Fe, NM 87501

LETITIA JAMES  
*Attorney General*  
*State of New York*  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005

DAN RAYFIELD  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Oregon*  
1162 Court Street NE  
Salem, OR 97301

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

PETER F. NERONHA  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Rhode Island*  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903

CHARITY R. CLARK  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Vermont*  
109 State Street  
Montpelier, VT 05609